Paul Hamlyn Foundation
ArtWorks Evaluation
Literature Review

May 2015
## Contents

1. **Introduction** ......................................................................................................................................... 3  
   1.1 Literature review as part of the evaluation research ................................................................... 3  
2. **Phase 1 Literature Review** ......................................................................................................................................................... 5  
   2.1 Scoping baseline knowledge for ArtWorks on participatory practices, infrastructures and quality standards ...................................................................................................................................... 5  
   2.2 Discussion: representation of thematic areas and art forms ....................................................... 6  
3. **Phase 2 Literature Review** ......................................................................................................................................................... 12  
   3.1 Mapping and reviewing research on career entry, professional development and working conditions for arts practice in participatory settings ............................................................................. 12  
4. **Annotated Bibliography** ......................................................................................................................................................... 17  
   4.1 Information, Advice and Guidance for artists working in participatory settings ......................... 17  
   4.2 Quality and models of practice ................................................................................................... 19  
   4.3 Contexts and settings for participatory practice ............................................................................. 25  
   4.4 Valuing community, participatory and socially engaged practices ............................................... 28  
   4.5 Critical cultural policy studies and participatory practice ........................................................... 31  
   4.6 Occupational frameworks, guidance and skills audits ................................................................. 32  
   4.7 Policies for cultural education .................................................................................................... 35  
   4.8 Career beginnings and motivations ............................................................................................ 39  
   4.9 Professionalisation ...................................................................................................................... 43  
   4.10 Diversity, working conditions and other challenges that face the artistic workforce .................... 45  
   4.10 How do we measure and value the work of participatory artists? ............................................. 48  
   4.11 Policy debates on value recognition and reward for artists working in this area ...................... 51  
   4.12 Literature reviews ....................................................................................................................... 53  
5. **Reference and reading lists** ......................................................................................................................... 57  
   5.1 Reference list ...................................................................................................................................... 57  
   5.2 Further reading ....................................................................................................................................... 67
Note to readers

This document combines two literature reviews with their accompanying annotated bibliographies which were undertaken for the evaluation of the Paul Hamlyn Foundation special initiative, ArtWorks. It has been produced by the evaluation team, Tamsin Cox, dha, and Dr. Abigail Gilmore, Institute for Cultural Practices, University of Manchester, with primary literature research and annotation undertaken by Institute for Cultural Practices alumni, Liz Fitzpatrick and Lottie Clarke.
Introduction
1 Introduction

This literature review was produced by the Evaluation Team for the Paul Hamlyn Foundation (PHF) Special Initiative ArtWorks, with support from the ArtWorks Pathfinders who have contributed research and bibliographic materials to the literature which it features. The review aims to:

- Provide a basis for contextualising both the research activities of the Pathfinders and the wider ArtWorks programme activities undertaken by PHF, within the evaluation;
- Contribute to the understanding of the wider bodies of knowledge and practice which Pathfinder and PHF research are building upon; and
- Comprise a useful bibliography for the Pathfinders, PHF and others working in this area.

The review of literature was an ongoing activity throughout the period of the Initiative, which encompasses literature from three main sources: policy, practice and academic research. The bibliography therefore includes academic monographs, textbooks and journal articles, consultancy reports, strategy documents, editorial and practitioner articles in sector publications. There are also a small number of entries which pick up articulations from websites or other corporate literature. It also includes bibliographies from Pathfinder partners and from relevant university taught courses, for example from MA Applied Theatre, University of Manchester.

1.1 Literature review as part of the evaluation research

As part of the evaluation for the ArtWorks programme, the research team undertook two phases of literature review, the first published as part of the Interim Evaluation Report and the second to complement the Final Evaluation Report. The first phase identified literature sources and resources on broad themes useful to ArtWorks partners and stakeholders related to the development of participatory arts practice. In contrast, the second phase focused on specific research themes emerging from the ArtWorks pathfinders’ various forms of enquiry, and specifically included the research outputs from the Initiative, contextualised by selected wider research relevant to these themes. Both phases of the literature review are discussed below in short summaries of their methodologies and key findings, followed by a comprehensive annotated bibliography comprising the literature under review.
Phase 1
Literature Review
2 Phase 1 Literature Review

2.1 Scoping baseline knowledge for ArtWorks on participatory practices, infrastructures and quality standards

This literature review aimed to map and scope the key sources of knowledge relevant to the primary stakeholder group for ArtWorks Pathfinders, including professional practitioners, policy makers and those involved in influencing, providing and evaluating professional development and training for artist-practitioners in participatory settings and activities.

Literature searches focused on keywords derived from the planning documents which underpin the ArtWorks programme and which articulate the programme’s strategic aims and objectives. As a strategic intervention using action research to explore the training and development needs of artists who work in participatory settings, these focused on developing:

- Better understanding of what constitutes quality in the work thus ensuring better experiences for participants
- Better infrastructure for training and development of artists at all stages of their careers to assist in addressing the geographical lottery identified.
- Models of good practice that have been shared, disseminated and hopefully replicated in non-pathfinder areas
- More joined up thinking across funding agencies in relation to the workforce development issues implicit in the programme
- More developed provision across all art forms assisting in plugging the gaps identified.
- A major shift in the value and perception of the role of artists working in participatory settings.

The literature was drawn from searches of electronic databases and library resources, including academic and professional practice journals, web searches for policy documents and collation of existing literature reviews and bibliographic materials from Pathfinder participants, academic colleagues and elsewhere. The following keywords were used in searching:

- artists, participatory, settings, quality, infrastructure, practice, models, provision, training, community arts, education, strategic development, professional development, value, social engagement, aesthetics, transformative, spaces, places.

The literature review comprises:

- Annotated bibliographies on keyword searches, with suggested categories and examples
- A current policy and practice literature review, with a focus on: networks and infrastructure, skills and workforce, education
- Further bibliographies from a number of research communities/communities of practice, including: Applied theatre, Theatre In Education; Arts and Health; Community Music; ArtWorks Pathfinders
The bibliographic references gathered here can be mapped against literature type, art form and settings categories as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Dance</th>
<th>Theatre &amp; performance</th>
<th>Visual arts</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Literary arts</th>
<th>Prison/probation</th>
<th>Community &amp; neighbourhood</th>
<th>Health &amp; wellbeing</th>
<th>Education &amp; learning</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic research</strong></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grey literature – practice</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grey literature - policy</strong></td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.2 Discussion: representation of thematic areas and art forms

This mapping shows the number and proportion of different texts for different thematic areas and art forms. Those with the highest number of texts include ‘education and learning’ and ‘health and wellbeing’, which both feature a relative balance between academic and policy or practice texts. These are areas where there has been some significant research activity, featuring both commissioned and collaborative work with academic institutions, as well as literature signalling recent policy and strategy development.
The large number of texts on theatre and performance is partly due to bias in our search mechanisms: the bibliography currently includes the reading lists drawn directly from a number of higher education course units from Drama and Performance Studies (from University of Manchester) and so is more indicative of literature sourced through peer referral than the proportion of theatre-based research articles on professional participatory practice, per se. However, it may also reveal the relative buoyancy of Applied Theatre as a research and teaching sub-discipline which draws on and contributes to the knowledge base of theatre-making and performance studies as participatory practices in a wide-range of settings. Certainly it has generated a range of research articles and publications concerned with the application of a particular art form across different settings – education, science, public engagement, prisons and criminal justice, health and wellbeing, and so on – which appear significantly more voluminous than other art forms.

Art forms and cultural practices under-represented by this literature review include written word, live literature and other literary arts practices, and institution-based practices, such as those working with museums and galleries, for example curatorial and outreach workers, the role of artists within museums, writers and poets in residence schemes and so on. These forms also had limited visibility in ArtWorks; further research is recommended into these art forms if a more comprehensive picture of existing knowledge, theory and practice of the artist-practitioner in contemporary participatory settings is required.

Of other art forms, only music has a similar profile to drama, theatre-making and performance in terms of a body of research literature which specifically concerns its application in participatory settings. Music is also represented within arts education literature, particularly in terms of the recent policy focus on music education and the concurrent changes to music education infrastructure. The area of ‘community music’ has recently been the topic of a comprehensive literature review (Mackay et al, 2011) which examines the ways in which community music has been conceptualised, defined and in some ways constructed through the politics, practices and institutions concerned with its continuation. The report finds that much of the literature is concerned with the ‘doing’ of community music – establishing a framework for practice rather than theorisation, indeed the authors find a resistance to theoretical reflection: “the movement has been resource-oriented rather than actively reflexive” (Mackay and Higham, 2011: 6). The report identifies research gaps which include, interestingly in the context of this review, research into freelance practitioner careers, evidence of impact and value and the potential for a pedagogy for community music. It also proposes “community arts as an important and enduring aspect of grassroots participatory cultural work is an area worthy of on-going research for any and all ‘connected communities’ (Mackay and Higham, 2011: 11).

Community arts is in many ways the unspoken shibboleth – although the words ‘community’ and ‘arts’ appear in the vast majority of literature identified here, it is rare that the phrase is actively interpolated. It seems that its redundancy as an historic term aligned with particular practices and politics of local arts development is permanent and unlikely to be rescinded. In its place, there is a discussion identifiable within this literature which proposes a spectrum of practices that attempt to bridge ‘community’ – as a diverse set of contexts, settings and interests – and ‘arts’. This more inclusive frame can be seen in research by Brown et al (2011) on participatory work, which through case study analysis, sets out five stages of participation - ‘Spectating, Enhanced Engagement, Crowd Sourcing, Co-creation and Audience-as-artist’ (Brown et. al, 2011: 4). These distinctive stages, or rungs on the ladder, of participation are conceptualised in terms of distance between the artist and the gaze or audience of the artist, and the proportional contribution of each to the resulting art works (Lowe, 2011). They are also defined in terms of their intended outcomes: for example, the distinction between public art works which are placed
within settings and communities, and socially-engaged works, which aim to engender dialogue with and within social groups via artist and arts-led processes (Wilson 2008).

However, there is inherent resistance to developing a single typology or framework which defines these distinctions resulting from the lack of consistent and coherent language and terminology, the multifarious practices across art forms, and the changing and developing nature of participatory arts practice and policy (Lowe 2011). Participatory arts practices are about change and will include disruption of some form: for Wilson, the required collaboration and dialogue leads to the “destabilisation of identities, of all parties, as a productive, rather than negative state” (Wilson 2008: 5). Developing methodologies which facilitate the move from spectatorship towards participatory practices is also viewed as an essential part of audience development (Brown et al, 2011; DCMS, 2007; Maitland, 2006) providing opportunities for greater sustainability in arts provision by promoting long-term change, e.g. in encouraging childhood participation to build audiences for the future (NEA, 2010). Advocacy literature surrounding arts participation focuses heavily upon arts education for children, but fails to provide evidence that this transfers into adult participation (Brown et al, 2011). There is also an assumption that for quality outcomes, participation should extend not only to active involvement but also to co-production of definitions and expectations of quality within participatory arts. As the NFER report recommends “the voice of children and young people themselves needs to be heard in the quality debate” (Lord et al, 2012: iv). This is something which is specifically addressed in research which explores children’s perceptions as participants (Barrett and Smigiel, 2007).

There is a similar diversity in how practitioners describe excellence within their work, partly due to a range of art forms and the subjective nature of judgment. There is also an inherent confusion about whether excellence and quality relate to the ‘inputs’ of artistic practice or the outputs of projects and programmes (whether artistic, societal or in terms of personal experience). A central motif is the dichotomy of process versus product, and some literature points to the motivations for participation as personal development rather than artistic outcome (Lord et al, 2012; Nehru, 2011). Tensions between personal, societal and aesthetic outcomes are also redolent in discussion of the institutional contexts for commissioning of participatory arts – in the positioning of “artist as social worker” in the multiple expectations and agendas of settings where this “dialogic work” takes place, and the prioritisation of social over aesthetic outcomes (Evans, 2010; Wilson, 2008)

Participatory work therefore engenders divergent expectations of desirable outcomes which are specific to individual project aims and which are therefore difficult to assimilate in a single standard of excellence. The gradation of what constitutes quality within participatory settings is partly explained by the broad spectrum of audiences and art forms (Lord et al, 2012; Lowe, 2011). There is no single framework for understanding and introducing measures for quality; and despite the overwhelming aspiration to devise metrics – for performance management, for evaluation, for measurement of ‘social returns on investment’ and for advocacy purposes, there is also lack of methodology and framework with rigour by which these valuations are conducted (Lord et al, 2012; Miles, 2009).

The policy orientation of the research literature is also identifiable by the thematic areas it speaks to, which reproduce the ‘target groups’ of instrumental cultural policy. These include research on developing targeted strategies for increasing participation to combat social exclusion for vulnerable groups (ACE, 2010; Cutler 2009, DCMS, 2007); arts and health (White, 2010; White & Robson, 2009; Daykin, 2009); broader social and community impacts identified as part of process of regeneration and community development (Matarasso, 1997; Evans, 2009; Kay, 2001; Jermyn, 2001, Kumaraswami, 2009). Whilst much of this literature is concerned with improving the practices and provision for
increasing participation for ‘targeted groups’, there is also a critical cultural policy studies literature which challenges and problematizes the claims of social impact and which strongly critiques the efficacies of instrumental cultural policy in relation to cultural participation (Belfiore, 2002; Mirza, 2009; Rimmer, 2009).

The current policy focus on participatory arts and educational strategies for children and young people is not simply an extension of the tenor of cultural participation policies established in the 1990s and 2000s, however, but a reflection of the continuing attempts to undertake curriculum review and educational reform which begun under New Labour but which form a central plank of the Coalition government’s arts policy. This review considers some of the recent policy literature on arts in education (e.g. Henley 2012) however it has not included the research literature generated through initiatives such as Creative Partnerships and its successor Culture, Creativity and Education (CCE). The knowledge generated through research and evaluation activities has helped to produce training, guidance and competency frameworks – including those offered by CCE and by the Consortium for Participatory Arts Learning (C-PAL). The Creative and Cultural Skills Council has also invested in research on sector blueprints and audits in order to inform skills development activities, such as the development of Apprenticeships, training Academies, Sector Skills agreements, competency frameworks and the development of National Occupational Standards (NOS) which have relevance to the ArtWorks programme. The latter have now been developed for Dance Leadership and Community Arts. Whilst there are clearly transferrable standards written into the Dance Leadership NOS, the majority of the skill areas referred to within the Community Arts NOS suppose that the role is largely administrative, and therefore does not engage with areas of artistic practice relevant to artists working in participatory settings.

Despite the concerns of a fragmented and dispersed range of approaches, the lack of clarity in definition, the difference between art forms and the policy-driven nature of arts commissioning, there is a clear sense gained through that a developing knowledge base exists from which to develop a more coordinated infrastructure for developing next practice. This is most significant in recent attempts to set out the key principles and drivers for improving quality, for example in the NFER report for Arts Council England on raising the standards work with children and young people (Lord et al, 2012). Indeed, looking across the practice literature, there are numerous guides to good practice, which include tools and approaches to measurement, checklists for project start-ups (Brown et al, 2011), some of which are targeted at particular art forms and settings (DfES, 2002; Jones, 2004; White, 2010; White & Robson, 2009), some at particular participant groups (Thomas and Lyles, 2007). Arts Council England (2006; 2008) offer two further resources for guidance and project planning tools for children and young people and young people at risk, respectively.

There is no shortage therefore in research-informed resources which are concerned with influencing the quality of the processes for delivering and providing access to participatory arts. There isn’t, conversely, a shared understanding of what quality outcomes might be, and definitions for excellence remain elusive. There are multiple parameters and criteria for describing excellence across different art forms and practices, in part based in the subjective nature of judgment (Lowe, 2011). This raises the issue of how transferability of knowledge across different settings and art forms as well as between different kinds of skills training providers – e.g. from schools and formal education settings to other participatory settings, and between different forms of learning, training, information and guidance. This is a useful area of enquiry for further enquiry.
The practice literature provides some preliminary insights into the types of training and support provided through professional bodies and networks established for and by practitioners. Many small professional networks are generally art-form specific, offering individual training and resources, but contributing to the overall lack of joined-up thinking and coordination between different agencies and bodies. There are many calls for more formalized training structures which complement and work with the grain of current infrastructural reform for cultural education and non-formal education provision (Sellers, 2011; National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education, 1999; Henley, 2011).

Finally, this literature review suggested that despite the large number of existing toolkits, guides to good practice and project set-up and the proliferation of professional and self-organised networks there are some clear, identifiable research gaps which cut across the different literature types. These include the lack of information and research on the motivations, pathways and progression routes for artist-practitioners who find themselves within this area of practice. A substantial part of the literature on participation and participatory arts is concerned with the proposed outcomes – with social gains, benefits and value rather than with quality per se. Research and reflection on participatory arts focuses on policy-driven issues, such as the measurement, promotion and evidencing of instrumental outcomes, and there is significantly less content which considers the professional practice of artist-practitioners in participatory arts from their own perspective or in relation to the specific skills, routes and accreditation and training required for professionalizing and regulating practice.

These findings underline the interests of ArtWorks Pathfinders in focusing on the professional development needs and experiences for artist-practitioners, their career trajectories and motivations, whilst also contributing to the knowledge base which can inform policy and practice through better occupational standards and training infrastructure.
Phase 2
Literature Review
3 Phase 2 Literature Review

3.1 Mapping and reviewing research on career entry, professional development and working conditions for arts practice in participatory settings

While the previous review sought to identify and scope the main resources available to ArtWorks stakeholders, academics and practitioners, this review is more of a round-up of the ArtWorks programme’s collective outputs in the context of existing knowledge of artistic practice in participatory settings. It reflects the body of working papers, reports, studies and projects undertaken throughout the ArtWorks tenure, as well as continuing to map other developing literatures in this area. It does not comprise a systematic review of all literature and evidential material for the many areas investigated throughout the ArtWorks programme, but instead focuses on a number of themes which were highlighted as knowledge gaps through the enquiry-based learning process, concerning the career paths and professional development of artists working in and with participatory settings and practices.

Following the initial search using the themes and keywords, three overarching areas emerged through which to categorise literature review findings which reflect the research interests of the ArtWorks initiative. Subsequently the annotated bibliography comprises sections which loosely map the chronological ‘journey’ of a participatory artist, beginning with entry level material on becoming a participatory artist, then professional development, analysis of the work force for arts practice in participatory settings, and a final reflection on how participatory work, as a whole, is valued or measured.

The initial section, titled ‘How do people become artists working in participatory settings?’ annotates literature that looks into the entry level points for a career in arts practice in participatory settings. One of the key findings to come from the ArtWorks initiative has been concerns over the motivations and ambitions associated with a career in arts practice in participatory settings (Burns & Cox, 2014). Many practitioners who consider themselves participatory artists became so either through chance circumstances or due to a lack of alternative options. And there are as many practitioners who do not consider themselves as working in a participatory setting, merely terming themselves artists, and not seeing themselves as pigeon-holed or restricted to a participatory sector easily clubbed together with broader terms such as community, engagement and access (Lowe, 2014). As the testimonies from visual artists in the Signpost report (Francis, 2013) attest, there are many different routes and options on leaving art school with little signposting, or prior guidance. The report also suggests that every artist will at some point work with the public, many collaboratively and participatory ways, and this can lead to practitioners feeling unprepared and exposed without suitable training or support:

Working in a participatory setting is not for everyone, but debates are raging about the importance and purpose of working with people in a meaningful way. Many opportunities and funding bodies build in the necessity of working with people, and it is important that if you decide to apply for this kind of work, you are aware of what you are letting yourself in for. You have to want to do it or you will be found out – and there is nothing worse than being found out in front of a crowd (Francis, 2013: 16).

If artists at the beginning of their careers are confused over terminology and practice associated with the participatory arts sector, this presents a challenge when trying to discuss the educational needs of
those actively wanting to pursue a participatory career path. The signposting and progression routes for participatory artists are unclear, and there is little underpinning research or data on motivations for entering or progressing into a career in arts practice in participatory settings.

Another finding of the review was the knowledge gaps on how participatory artists’ careers are shaped and influenced by external factors. Some of the smaller projects to come from the wider ArtWorks programme, such as Placements in Practice at Royal Conservatoire Scotland and Student Placements in Prison Learning Centres through the Glasgow School of Art, have sought to open up dialogue between practicing participatory artists and young people either deciding on an artistic career, or wanting more information about their creative career options (Dean, 2014). These opportunities for discussion were both interesting and pioneering as this vital information is seldom fed back into education and training. There is little information available on whether the motivations for a career in arts practice in participatory settings due to social responsibility, education, training, progression opportunities, economic need or other extrinsic policy agendas. It should, however, be noted that from these discussions it became clear career pathways themselves are seen as problematic as many artists (participatory or otherwise) do not view their career development as a linear process. This is an important point to consider when trying to ‘plug the gaps’ in suitable training for professional development as a ‘linear structure’ of education, training and CPD for arts practice in participatory settings may fit the reality of a non-linear career path.

The Changing the Conversation conference held by ArtWorks in April 2013 was an important intervention generating feedback and discussion on these issues and identifying the need for new research to fill these gaps, as was the Reprising the Conversation event in the following year, at which a call for contributions to a double special edition of the Journal of Arts and Communities was launched. These activities are direct interventions (alongside others) by ArtWorks to developing the critical mass of knowledge about artists working in participatory settings, and the career development.

The review also considers wider discussions on arts education and arts representation in the curriculum through seminal policy documents on arts and cultural education, as part of the wider context for how children and young people are introduced to the role (for example, NACCCE, 1999 and Fleming, 2011). Arts education, and the role models and career examples, children and young people encounter potentially link to the factors which affect individuals’ entry into careers in arts practice in participatory settings. They also constitute and reflect wider perceptions of how artists and creative practitioners’ careers are represented in the national educational scheme, and how their value and importance are recognised. Part of the story for any emerging artist will be how they were introduced to their current practice, and education is a key factor in that. There also exists challenges for young people inspired through high quality experiences of participation themselves who are then unable to find a way into that area of work due to a lack of information (dha, 2014b). Not only that but society as a whole plays its part in terms of how children and young people are introduced to the value of arts and artists, and the role of artists in society. These attitudes and structures feed into the larger debate on how people become participatory artists and the value placed on careers of artists, which may influence future career decisions and paths.

The annotated bibliography identifies literature which focuses on career development, training and professionalisation. The majority of these resources have been produced by the ArtWorks pathfinders, practitioners and partners. Reports on surveys, implemented policies or strategies, and evaluation of project work all feature heavily. One of the great successes to come from the ArtWorks initiative has been the implementation of a postgraduate qualification for participatory artists working in music. The
Certificate for Music Educators, awarded by the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music and pioneered through Trinity Laban, was introduced in January 2013. One of the ongoing debates to come out of the ArtWorks’ discussions has been where professional training should be implemented (Burns & Cox, 2014). Offering a professional career path through academia, while promoting high standards at nationally recognised levels, also leads to discussions around workforce diversity and potential elitism. A fine balance needs to be drawn through professionalising the world of arts practice in participatory settings while not excluding young people or emerging artists (Brown, Lauder and Ashton, 2011).

Apprenticeships, internships and work placements have all been developed as further work in this area, and many of the results of these schemes have been included in this review (Dean, 2014 and Smethurst, 2013). ArtWorks have both researched and funded sector-led, collaborative pockets of research into areas of continuing professional development and training (Phelby, 2012 and Leighton-Kelly, 2012). These investigations seek to empower both the sector, and the practitioners within it, to structure their own professional development and frameworks.

A further section looks at issues directly concerning the participatory art workforce, including diversity, equality and working conditions. This area also looks to investigate the workforce make-up and to establish what individuals and collectives such a workforce encompasses. The recent study by Arts Council England’s report on equality and diversity within the arts and cultural sector is included here. The report, which used 146 case studies to investigate how disability, race, gender and age are represented amongst the sector, concluded that socio-economic background and a lack of access to education are seen, loosely, as the main barriers to both participation in the arts and developing a career within the arts practice in participatory settings (ACE, 2014). The Arts Council Consilium Report (2014) also argues that there is a lack of representation and role models for young people from the world of arts practice in participatory settings, from all backgrounds, to engage with. This can be seen to compound earlier arguments about practitioners’ not feeding back into educational arts settings, but is also linked to wider concerns about education, especially regarding gender, and the national curriculum. Ettinger and Hoffman’s (1990) work fortifies this argument by showing how female art students had no knowledge of women’s art heritage and the representation of women within the very sector they wished to forge careers in. There is a greater body of work in this area, led by examples such as Collins and Sandell (1984), although there is a demonstrable absence of similar research specific to participatory artists. Issues around labelling and general definitions of participatory artists also impinge on collating responses from a workforce that may not, as yet, identify themselves as one.

The balance of research on creative workers focuses on the private rather than ‘not-for-profit’ sector, and this further inhibits our understanding of issues for participatory artists as workers. It is worth noting that differences between the two sectors could directly contribute not only to a lack of diversification within the workforce engaging in arts practice in participatory settings, but also a lack of professionalisation and attributed value. As not-for-profit organisations are so much more reliant on state funding, budget policies and collaborative participation their resources are often stretched having a direct impact on their abilities to contribute to professional development, improved arts education and career support. While artists’ career paths may not be linear, issues around job security, stable income streams and perceptions of quality all impact on the sector. One of the key pieces of work currently ongoing in this area is that of the Artists Information Company who conducted major survey (funded by Arts Council England) into the financial conditions of practicing artists under the Paying Artists campaign. This work looks to research perceptions of value amongst artists and hiring institutions, while also discussing conditions of pay, the challenges organisations and individuals face when discussing payment and introducing possible frameworks that look to standardise rates of pay.
One of the greatest challenges currently faced by the campaign is artists’ own lack of understanding when it comes to commercial enterprise. There are clear skill gaps where artists remain ill-informed about expectations of pay, or even whether any should be received at all (The Artists Information Company, 2011; Artists Union England, 2014). These issues contribute to general barriers to the professionalisation of arts practice in participatory settings, and compound other problems, such as workforce composition (particularly in terms of entry by lower socio-economic groups), under-employment and collective representation (Oakley, 2011; Steiner & Schneider, 2013).

Finally, it must be noted that the literature collated here is primarily focused on ‘ArtWorks’ art forms and practices: prevalence has been given to those participatory art disciplines of dance, music, performance art including theatre, visual art and even crafts. While these disciplines have been included in the literature more generally under the umbrella of arts practice in participatory settings it has meant alternative factions, which could also be included under this participatory banner, are absent. These have been omitted generally due to the lack of representation they hold amongst the ArtWorks pathfinders and partnership organisations, and include, for example, participatory design practice, architecture as a participatory practice, and design thinking. Since as collaborative partnerships become more ubiquitous, we can assume that further disciplinary will also develop including participatory elements.
Annotated Bibliography
4 Annotated Bibliography

The following annotated bibliography is compiled from the two literature reviews and organised according to the following sections:

- Information, Advice and Guidance for artists working in participatory settings
- Quality and models of practice
- Contexts and settings for participatory practice
- Valuing socially engaged practices
- Critical cultural policy studies and participatory practice
- Occupational frameworks, guidance and skills audits
- Policies for cultural education
- Career beginnings and motivations
- Professionalisation
- Diversity, working conditions and other challenges that face the artistic workforce
- How do we measure and value the work of participatory artists?
- Policy debates on value recognition and reward for artists working in this area

4.1 Information, Advice and Guidance for artists working in participatory settings

This section comprises texts which offer guidance, information and advice on different aspects of work, education, training, standards and work in arts which take place in participatory settings and/or which have a particular focus on developing engagement and participation in the arts by specific groups. It also includes some specific examples of bespoke training and accreditation for artists as professionals.

**Keywords and search terms:** profession, work, labour, trade associations, regulation, policy, artist workforce/professional development, education, training, accreditation.


This report gives guidance and knowledge on safeguarding, for artists and arts organisations working with vulnerable citizens. It highlights the relevant policies and procedures professionals should be aware of when working in this area.


This article discusses the need for higher education institutions to support the development of community arts professionals working in the area of music.


A document which gives useful advice on child protection issues, for both individuals and organisations working on cultural projects with young people in Scotland.

This pilot aimed to create qualifications and accredited training for poets within schools. It also outlined the need for some occupational standards for the delivery of this work.


A straightforward guide for kickstarting a youth arts project.


A research report from a US study aiming to better understand why individuals become more involved in the arts and advising organisations how to influence this process.


This paper highlights the ongoing debate of the balance between academic and vocational training for students within the cultural sector. It highlights the fragmented nature of an artist’s working life and asks how creative students (particularly dance) should be better prepared for the world of work.


This paper outlines the positive impacts of artists working in participatory early years settings and also offers advice for best practice and accredited training for those wishing to work professionally in this area. It recommends the need to recognise a unified core set of basic skills by training agencies (FE and HE).


This report gives an account of the work of music educators, their professional training and avenues for continuing professional development. It recommends the need to recognise a unified core set of basic skills in line with national standards to be used by musical training agencies (FE and HE). It also recommends more joined up thinking for music education policy and practice.


Research that highlights the work of visual artists within Scotland, defining the demographic and their practice, training, professional development, earnings, funding and facilities. It showed that over half of the sample used teaching as a source of income, and that there was an overall dissatisfaction in the opportunities for professional development. Although not specifically focused on participatory
practices, it provides some valuable insight into artists’ routes into employment, qualifications, training and continuing professional development (CPD).


This research highlights the work of professionals in the discipline of dance. It highlights the need for professional development within workshop leadership, teacher training and the encouragement of national accredited qualifications.


This report outlines models of good practice within live art development. It highlights it as a potential area for arts participation, which is in need of being nurtured and encouraged by artists and administrators.

Staffordshire University (2012) MA Community and Participatory Arts Programme Specification. Faculty of Arts, Media and Design.

This accredited qualification provides a bespoke academic programme of professional development for those working in the participatory sector. The MA focuses upon discussion, critical debate and the application of work-related skills to enhance understanding of the broader policy context in which participatory artists are operating.


This qualification aims to improve the teaching and leadership skills of artists wishing to undertake participatory arts as a profession.


A report addressing the state of training for dance practitioners, which explores the need for more structured qualifications.

4.2 Quality and models of practice

These texts explore how measures and standards of quality are understood and outlines benchmarking processes and competencies aiming to ensure quality standards, derived from work in different countries, cultural settings and art forms.

Keywords and search terms: quality, practices, skills, standards, competencies, value

This work offers a guide for nurturing participation in the arts by disabled people, from active to receptive involvement. It also includes resources to aid implementation.


This gives a structured outline for artists when project planning and providing evidence and evaluation to ensure high quality within project work. Accompanying resources on preparation give added guidance.


A toolkit for artists and arts organisations assessing the quality of arts projects involving children and young people.


The article reports on research measuring the performance of arts organisations in relation to “artistic vibrancy” which examined 29 Australian and UK performing arts organisations, including the Royal Opera House and Scottish Opera, to consider their processes of “artistic self-assessment”. The article reviews literature concerning issues of community relevance, audience engagement and stimulation in relation to tools for self-assessment, peer review and performance management. Through research on its case studies, it identifies a range of different practices and models for reviewing, measuring and assessing performance and finds that not one size fits all. It concludes that:

“(T)here are common, good practice principles which could be useful to arts companies looking to establish self-assessment or review their existing assessment mechanisms. The examples demonstrate the benefits of a robust and meaningful artistic self-assessment process to an arts company’s on-going improvement, audience engagement, artist and staff satisfaction, and – ultimately – artistic vibrancy. Funding agencies can also learn from the examples, recognizing that self-assessment is at its best when it is a collaborative process that suits the particular conditions of an art form and arts company. A company can employ both quantitative and qualitative methods to inform their artistic decision making, as long as they are not merely an added-on process to satisfy funders. Universal templates, if not created in genuine consultation with the sector, could result in “box ticking”, which can obstruct meaningful artistic assessment.” (Bailey and Richardson, 2010: 304)


This article gives an exploration of the Venezuelan music-making model, which encourages children as young as 2 or 3 years old to take up an instrument. It focuses on the model’s success factors and discusses its distinguishing characteristics.

This paper summarises the role of participatory arts within the larger cultural ecology. It acknowledges the current seismic shift from ‘a sit back and be told culture to a making-and-doing culture’ (Brown et. al, 2011: 3) which has been largely influenced by an acceleration in technology and the Internet. It identifies that such growth has allowed for a wider platform in arts participation where ‘We all’ (Brown et. al, 2011: 4) can create, shape and influence culture. The paper begins by clearly defining the terminology associated within the sporadic paradigm of participatory arts. It then gives a brief description of the paradigm’s many personal, community and social benefits and highlights emerging benefits as a result of its new ecological setting, such as a greater variety of audience preferences, thus more scope to improve audience development. It encourages artists, curators and administrators to embrace this current climate through manipulating the ‘diversity of preferences, settings and formats’ (Brown et al, 2011: 11), in order to improve attendance, programming, popularity and competitiveness. Although not thoroughly discussed it acknowledges the importance of space, place and setting in participatory arts (another keyword area). It also recognises missing research and areas or knowledge expansion. For example, advocacy literature surrounding arts participation focuses heavily upon arts education for children, but fails to provide evidence that this transfers into adult participation.

The paper highlights the many variations of participatory arts displayed through an Audience Involvement Spectrum. The scale ranges from receptive to participatory involvement, naming the five stages ‘Spectating, Enhanced Engagement, Crowd Sourcing, Co-creation and Audience-as-artist’ (Brown et. al, 2011: 4). Amongst these five stages of participation, Brown et. al also describes a further layer of creative control where participants hold curatorial, interpretive and inventive roles within the artistic involvement. Alongside the varying stages of involvement, these components allow for endless creative possibilities for arts organisations. The paper then goes on to describe various worldwide case studies combining the defined elements of arts participation. The case studies are complemented by some advisory questions ‘for those who plan to conceptualize and implement an active arts program:

- What form(s) of artistic expression do you propose to engage (e.g. dance, music, sculpture, spoken word)?
- What scale or breadth of impact do you aim to make?
- How might technology be used to extend impact?
- What are you hoping to accomplish in terms of participant outcomes, audience outcomes and community outcomes?
- To what extent will the activity yield an artistic outcome that is visible to the community?
- What community partners might be brought into the project?
- What degree of technical proficiency is required of audience members or participants?
- Does the activity allow for solidarity participation (e.g., at home), social involvement, or both?
- To what extent will professional artists and curators be involved? What qualifications will they have?
- How many entry points into the project/activity can be created? Is the activity accessible to people who cannot physically attend?’ (Brown et al, 2011: 23)

This article reports a study on pupil’s reflection of participating in workshops with 3 professional musicians. It then discusses the quality of students’ experiences and learning outcomes.


This is a comprehensive guide for incorporating education and participatory programmes into museums and galleries, revealing models of best practice.


This article presents how cities can encourage community engagement within their citizens through arts initiatives. It claims that arts initiatives will be the main contributor in creating successful schools and universities in a vibrant twenty-first century city.


The work aims to reveal and debate the principles of quality underpinning work in the arts sector for children and young people. It examined how aspects of quality may be supported and measured through a set of frameworks and tools.

- The seven principles in improving quality were identified as:
  - Striving for excellence
  - Being authentic
  - Being exciting, inspiring and engaging
  - Ensuring a positive, child-centred experience
  - Actively involving children and young people
  - Providing a sense of personal progression
  - Developing a sense of ownership and belonging

An underpinning principle was to complete the cycle of planning, monitoring, review and reflection to better understand the outcomes and impact of the work was identified as vital to the above. Drivers for improving quality include: self-improvement, recognising excellence, comparing organisations/activities against a common standard and providing evidence of impact to demonstrate value. There was a strong influence on (self-improvement).

Aspects used to demonstrates outcomes of quality were:

- Artistic skills, knowledge and understanding
- Attitudes and values towards the arts
- Activity, involvement and progression in the arts
- Personal, social and communication skills
- Health and well-being
Aspirations, careers and life pathways.

There were a range of approaches used to measure the above with little detail given and a focus on the short term rather than longer term impact.

Gaps and issues:
- Clear definitions, distinctions, principles and measures about the quality of the art itself.
- Specificity and differentiation by age and particular needs of individuals and groups.
- Guidance on measuring outcomes robustly and demonstrating quality.

The debates within measuring quality included:
- How far do quality principles apply across the sector?
- If self-improvement is the key driver, how do we ensure that the process is rigorous and achieves the desired improvement in quality?
- How can barriers be best addressed?
- To what extent is benchmarking and cross sector comparison necessary or desirable?
- Conclusion and next steps.
- The voice of children and young people themselves needs to be heard in the quality debate.
- Arts Council’s road map to include a continuation of the sector-led debate started here.

Key recommendations:
- Continue engaging with practitioners to develop and test the quality principles.
- Develop the Arts Council’s relationship with the sector so leading practitioners become advocates for quality.
- Support knowledge sharing among practitioners
- Ultimately help ensure that all arts and cultural providers supporting work by, with and for children and young people are committed to monitoring quality and self-improvement.


This audit was the first piece of work undertaken by Artworks: North East to gain a wider knowledge of the participatory practices being carried out by the organisations in the programme. Lowe acknowledges that this area of work is rich and diverse and although this can be advantageous, the work lacks a unified approach from every organization. To develop their knowledge, Artworks: North East approached each of the partnership organisations with specific research questions surrounding the delivery of their participatory arts practice, why they do it and their personal approach or philosophy towards participatory arts. They also asked them to comment on their participants, locations, management of excellence, language, employment of artists and training and development. Evidence showed that there were a range of commonalities across the organisations within ‘art-making, engagement and outreach, provision of creative spaces and building communities of practice, training artists and others to undertake participatory work and supporting participant’s creative progression’ (Lowe, 2011: 5). It was deemed that this area of work provided rich and diverse knowledge, which needed to be highlighted and articulated within a typology. However, it was also thought that creating such a typology whilst the practice was still in development could inhibit creation of further knowledge associated with the discipline.
The main findings of the research revealed a great diversity in how partners described excellence within their work, partly due to a range of art forms and the subjective nature of judgment. Desired outcomes of each participatory setting are quite individual to the project aims and therefore what may be considered a standard of excellence in one scenario could not be assimilated to all. It was also evident that the varying forms of participatory practices have not been clearly categorized resulting in a lack of coherent language. Although some words occur more than others, there is no common language for each genre. Work of Brown (2011) through the James Irvine Foundation has aimed to overcome these issues but Lowe believes categorisations are still unclear. He offers art making practice headings of ‘co-produced participatory art, artist-authored participatory art and talent/skills development’ (Lowe, 2011: 5). Lowe states that the area of participatory art lacks a common framework for defining its language and evaluating excellence. It was found that discrepancies also occurred across organisations in the rate of pay for artists and that there were significant gaps within training and development of employees. Organisations said this was due to a lack of resources and funding, meaning training could not be included within their budget.


This document is based on the 2008 Survey of Public Participation in the Arts for the United States. It aims to clearly define ‘arts participation’ in conjunction with cultural ecology, policy and practice. Participation is separated into three modes; attendance, arts creation and electronic-based media. The document aims to look between these modes, discussing the effects of the interaction between the three across various artistic disciplines. Through this research in then offers implications within practice, policy and research to provide a better quality of service for the future.


This paper outlines the social gains of arts projects and the need to evaluate and quantify these impacts of the creative processes to satisfy funders. It highlights issues of objectifying subjective quality standards in the area of community-based arts projects.


This paper addresses emerging issues of delivering varying art projects with marginalised young people. It considers the differing styles and approaches of practitioners and considers which are the most effective.


A review of professional participatory arts projects involving the elderly, discussing forms of best practice.
This book is written by community arts practitioners; it defines and discusses the many processes involved within this work.


Presents a theory of learning that starts with the assumption that engagement in social practice is the fundamental process by which we get to know what we know and by which we become who we are. This knowledge of social learning could impact the processes and quality of participation within the arts.


This report develops guidelines towards a set of shared principles, which constitute good practice. This work highlights good practice within arts and health but also outlines difficulties in generalizing these codes of practice. It highlights the arts practitioner not as an artist but as a mediator for engagement with participants that facilitates planning, delivery and evaluation. It addresses aspects of quality and how to benchmark these against risks involved with the work.


Guidelines for Good Practice for artists and healthcare professionals engaging in participatory arts practice in healthcare contexts in Ireland.


This guide outlines five stages of evaluation for arts projects; planning, collecting evidence, assembling and interpretation, reflecting and moving forward, reporting and sharing. The aim is to create some common methods in evaluation, which should help to raise the standards of arts education projects.

### 4.3 Contexts and settings for participatory practice

These texts are identified with particular contexts and settings for participatory arts practice, including resident or neighbourhood communities, health and social care, criminal justice and other types of institutional settings. They also consider context as the types of delivery – e.g. workshop, open mic night, education programmes at artist centres.

Keywords and search terms: spaces, place, urban regeneration, centre, community development, economic development

This chapter looks at the professional development of artists working in healthcare settings, noting the need for versatility and adaptability within the areas of arts therapy, community music and community arts.


The article discusses ways in which three British community artists established relationships and used materials to nurture participation. It acknowledges the need to create and atmosphere of care in a neutral setting.


This chapter gives an account of instrumental arts and creative practices that instigate urban regeneration. It focuses on how community arts initiatives have been a catalyst for social inclusion and diversity. The book ‘Spaces of Vernacular Creativity’ rethinks what constitutes creativity in our everyday lives. It also points to how creativity plays a role within economic development and urban regeneration, highlighting concepts such as the creative class, creative industries and bohemian cultural clusters where citizen participation is at the heart.


Fisher discusses the cultural practices that make-up the organization of participatory events, exploring participant motivations and how venues operate as sites for multiple literacies.


Gee accounts the workshop setting as distinctive mode for creative production.


This article argues that art spaces that are also public spaces have more potential to encourage community development. It examines the relationship between public space and community development at various different art spaces including artist cooperatives, ethnic-specific art spaces, and city-sponsored art centers in central city and suburban locations. Carl Grodach’s research is based at the University of Texas.

Hillman gives a concise guide for American artists working in various participatory settings. Discussion of techniques and training for artists within different case studies gives clear direction for artists working in this area.


This paper researched the wealth of artist centres clustered in the State of Minnesota. It highlights the solitary life of an artist and displays how this case study offers an alternative model for working artists. It reveals that the model combated artist isolation and also enhanced creativity, community development, quality of work and business acumen. It offers recommendations for the development of similar models.


The city of San Jose launched the Creative Entrepreneur Project, which aimed to improve San José’s collective ability to support, attract and develop artists. In the knowledge that arts and cultural activities animate cities and encourage economic development, the project set out to survey artists working in an around San Jose to highlight aspects that needed nurturing. It discusses issues facing artists; self-employment, place of work, finances, equipment, training.


This research looks at the impact of village hall performances by touring arts organisations on rural communities.


The impetus for this report stems from a need to satisfy the case for arts in criminal justice with policy makers. Miles outlines that although there is ‘a plethora of indirect and testimonial evidence which supports the view that the arts ‘work’ in criminal justice settings, this does not match up to the requirements of ‘robust’ evidence of impact’ (Miles, 2006: 11). Miles finds that this area of work lacks a robust methodology, theoretical frameworks and evaluation standards. The work is also inconsistently funded and therefore many of the projects are short term or one-offs. He concludes that the current limitations make it an unfavourable area for research and will reconsider this in the future if the area produces more long-term sequential projects.

This chapter outlines the literary workshop movement born in Cuba in the 1960s. These were policy initiatives, which encouraged Cubans to participate in cultural and educational activities. The priority was to reaffirm Cuban culture, keeping the Revolution strong whilst other socialist states collapsed elsewhere. It explains that the literary workshop movement has remained strong for nearly 50 years. It was cultural participation enforced on a mass scale, reaching thousands of citizens, with many participants benefitting socially and intellectually from the initiative. However, the writing also has an underlying tone of cynicism, noting that ‘the workshops form part of a state-run bureaucratic system, so it is important to view their contribution to literary culture not as natural but as a being shaped by power, albeit a productive as well as controlling power’ (Nehru 2011: 151). It acknowledges that Cuban cultural policy oscillates between artistic freedom and greater ideological control. The workshops proved to influence a way of life and a literary culture. A larger amount of Cuban writers became present although the writing was considered lower in the literature hierarchy. It was also found that the main lasting impact upon citizens was down to the process of participation rather than the literary guidance. The settings allowed for more face to face and communicative dialogue between citizens.


This work provides a commentary on the current practice of public art settings for artists, planners and policy makers involved in the process.


This book discusses the need for individuals to remain creative in order to flourish in this fast evolving world. It outlines how creativity can also positively impact the organisation of our education system and businesses.


This book suggests techniques for cultural institutions to develop visitor participation. It is divided into two parts Design for Participation and Participation in Practice. It gives a practical guide and also suggests current and dynamic methods of sustaining and encouraging evaluation. Online version available at www.participatorymuseum.org/read/

4.4 Valuing community, participatory and socially engaged practices

*These texts focus on ways of articulating the value of arts practice which is specifically designed to produce social benefits, and includes some key commentaries on the methods and discourses of evaluating the social impacts of arts.*

*Keywords and search terms: visual arts, social engaged practice, transformative practices, aesthetics*

This report reviews 13 London based arts organisations working with vulnerable or disadvantaged adults through a range of participatory settings. It highlights the varying work and its range of benefits and outcomes. It makes recommendations for future developments when working with this minority group, which could also adhere to other participatory arts.


This examines history, discourse, rhetoric and traditions relating to the thinking about instrumental and extrinsic outcomes of the arts, from Classical Greek civilization to the present day. It proposes that there has been a strong tendency to assume a relationship (both negative and positive) between the arts and social impacts which underlies all arts, cultural and social policy.


This paper looks at a large-scale community arts programme in the Speke/Garston area of Liverpool, UK. The aim of the project was to increase community involvement though a variety of participatory arts initiatives within a single, unifying project known as ‘Closer’. Evaluation showed that experience of working on the project had been challenging, enlightening, enriching with the project being of value to communities, practitioners and policy-makers.


This report begins by mapping 120 arts organisations currently working with the elderly through arts participation. It reviews this typology and notes a lack of arts policy, infrastructure and therefore funding for this work. It acknowledges the societal benefits and suggests areas of developments to improve the advocacy of this work.


This report focuses on ways of engaging disabled people, black and minority ethnic (BME) groups and lower socio-economic groups with cultural and sport activities. It outlines the drivers for involvement in such activities and promotes ways of stimulating activation.


This is a research project conducted by researchers from the Psychosocial Unit at UCLAN, supported by Arts Council England North West, The Gulbenkian Foundation and Northern Rock Foundation. The research aims were:
• to characterise the socially engaged practices of four case study organisations and investigate how they might facilitate change for individuals and communities
• to examine the ways in which these arts practices and change processes might be researched by developing a methodology sensitive to arts practice to account for their impact and influence.

The four case studies were Artangel (London) and Grizedale Arts (Coniston, Cumbria), FACT (Liverpool) and the Centre for Contemporary Arts (CCA) in Glasgow. The research report includes a short literature review focusing on definitions, practices and methodologies for evaluation, and reveals in detail the methodology of the research project, the conceptual apparatus applied and developed as part of the work and the key findings. These findings suggest the transformative practices of socially engaged arts revolve around the concept of an ‘aesthetic third’, a space which mediates self and identity and which mitigates risk in participation. The report concludes with a synthesis of key themes concerning the aesthetics, modes and recommendations for approaches to engagement found by studying these four organisational case studies and their institutional, policy and practice contexts.


This review gives a broad analysis of the arts and social exclusion. Firstly, how it can be measured, monitored and evaluated. Secondly, how the arts contributes towards combating social exclusion.


This book evaluates the social impact of the arts participation within personal development, social cohesion, community empowerment, self-determination, identity and health and wellbeing. Its main findings conclude that participation in arts activities brings social benefits, which are integral to the act of participation in a safe environment.


Introductory article to collection of six essays on different ways artists can engage with specific communities via residencies, collaborations, cross-cultural projects and research. Includes brief historical background and discussion of community arts, participatory arts, and the focus on process over product and different models for socially-engaged artistic practice. Wilson distinguishes between public art works that may be situated within settings and communities and socially-engaged works, which aim to engender dialogue with and within social groups via artist- and arts-led processes. She suggests that such approaches work on the basis that “understanding of the collaborative posits the destabilisation of identities, of all parties, as a productive, rather than negative state” – they are collaborations with communities, negotiated and dialogical. The issues of instrumentalism and bureaucracy within the institutional context for commissioning of socially-engaged work are also discussed, and the question of whether these stifle “the organic quality of collective processes and scope of human interactions that are fundamental to this way of working” is raised. The article also considers the problem of “artist as social work” and multiple expectations and agendas of contexts where this “dialogic work” takes place, raising the tensions surrounding the prioritisation of social over aesthetic outcomes. These themes are raised and illustrated by the accompanying essays:
• Kathy Rae Huffman ‘Central Asian Project’ - describes a programme of residencies and cultural exchange between artists from the UK and Kazakhstan that took place between 2006-08.
• Catherine Wilson ‘Dias & Riedweg: Border zones and poetic encounters’ - addresses three collaborative projects by Rio de Janeiro-based Mauricio Dias and Walter Riedweg who develop works with communities and social groups often on the edges of mainstream society.
• Charles Danby ‘Gayle Chong Kwan: Underground exchanges’ - explores how Gayle Chong Kwan developed avenues of exchange centred on relationships with food through a community-based residency facilitated by Platform for Art.
• Kai Oi Jay Yung ‘Guyan Porter residency’ – interview with artist about his residency at Chandrasevana Creation Centre in Sri Lanka.
• Charlie Levine ‘Rachel Grant and Stoke-on-Trent’ - Charlie Levine on Rachel Grants' relationship to her home town and how she explored notions of community following an award from Longhouse, an organisation in the West Midlands that supports research projects by artists focusing mainly on the public realm.
• Rachel Lois Clapham ‘Risking Radio Nights’- discusses David Blandy's Artangel commissioned project Radio Nights that aimed to uncover aspects of nocturnal London that would otherwise be invisible to regular city dwellers.

4.5 Critical cultural policy studies and participatory practice


Belfiore discusses the UK government’s growing interest in social inclusion, acknowledging the arts as a catalyst for this area, giving justification to public investment in the arts. The paper looks at the consequences of this new policy rationale on future funding.


A case study example of the role of literary participatory workshops as delivery strategy for Cuban cultural policies.


This Arts Council report brings together the meanings of cultural diversity and audience development from a variety of arts managers, policy makes, artists, academics and audiences. It probes for a shared understanding of cultural diversity and scrutinises its meaning. It explores examples of practice in implementing cultural diversity and looks to how this effects audience development and participation.

This article discusses the ways diversity shapes how organisations engage with their audiences and whether cultural policies instigating diversity contradict universality. It uses the case study of the Rich Mix centre multi-faceted arts venue in London’s ethnic East End.


This article accounts how recent local community music projects can aid inclusion for young people at risk of failing mainstream education. Through combating social exclusion this approach has been criticised has an ‘instrumental’ use of the arts. The paper gives an analysis of the negative impacts such cultural policies can have on participatory activity.

4.6 Occupational frameworks, guidance and skills audits

This list of references (partially annotated) features skills audits, guides and handbooks and occupational standards frameworks for training and professional development for artists.


A draft learning framework for artists who work with looked after children covering principles and values, workforce knowledge and skills, quality indicators, training and networking, quality improvement of work and accreditation.

Creative & Cultural Skills (2010a) ‘Sector Skills Agreement for the creative and cultural industries: An analysis of the skills needs of the creative and cultural industries in England’ (December, 2010)

Creative & Cultural Skills (2010b) ‘Sector Skills Agreement for the creative and cultural industries: An analysis of the skills needs of the creative and cultural industries in Wales’ (December, 2010)

Creative & Cultural Skills (2011) ‘Sector Skills Agreement for the creative and cultural industries: An analysis of the skills needs of the creative and cultural industries in Scotland’ (April, 2011)

Creative & Cultural Skills (2010c) ‘Sector Skills Agreement for the creative and cultural industries: An analysis of the skills needs of the creative and cultural industries in Northern Ireland’ (December, 2010)

The Sector Skills Agreement brings together labour market intelligence from across the creative and cultural industries, and provides an assessment of the industry’s skills requirements, the development of the workforce and likely future scenarios. The series includes separate reports for all regions in the United Kingdom. The Agreement for England notes that, on the whole, the sector tends to be highly qualifies, but that a third of employers feel that there are skills gaps in their current workforce. These skills gaps tend to relate to: ‘information communication Technology (ICT), marketing and technical skills.’
The report brings together workforce statistics, including size and average wage of key professions in the creative and cultural industries which includes (visual) artists, musicians, actors and entertainers and authors and writers. There is also information about the percentage of these professions with key qualification levels (predominantly offering an assessment of those with NQF Level 5 or above, and those with lower levels of qualifications).

The Agreement identifies training for those in the category ‘Associate professional and technical occupations’ – which includes most artists – as a priority, though it is worth noting that this seems partly to relate to assumptions that increased numbers of ‘offstage/backstage’ roles being required in the future. What is perhaps most interesting in employers’ responses was the fact that only 6% felt that skills gaps were caused by the ‘limited availability of relevant training’. The majority raised issues to do with finding time and finance for training as the major barriers to engaging with training. There was also a marked preference across the sector for informal (mostly non-accredited) training.


National Occupation Standards (NOS) relate to specific professions or jobs, and provide a list of things an individual needs to know and be able to do in order to fulfill a role successfully. CCS has worked with partners from across the creative and cultural industries to develop a number of NOS. Currently; there are 19 sector-specific NOS, with six in ‘Technical Theatre and Live Production/Performance’ and three for sub-areas of ‘Music Businesses’.

The NOS for Dance Leadership offers a specific definition of what ‘leading dance’ means:

‘this term is used to distinguish it from coaching and instructing, which whilst they form an important part of this work do not describe all competencies required for leading dance. In addition to, or sometimes instead of, adhering to a syllabus, tradition or curriculum built around a dance style or education, the dance leader will make opportunities for creative input from participants to shape their dance or dance programme. ‘Leading’ dance requires a practitioner to be able to research, plan, set up, market, teach/facilitate/make and evaluate dance with specified groups and/or individuals in a range of contexts.’

There are at least a number of activities specified within this definition, which appear coherent with the activities of artists working in participatory settings. The NOS goes on to identify 23 areas in which there are then specific items of knowledge and understanding required, and detailed performance criteria.

The 23 areas are:
1. Evaluate and communicate your skills in leading dance
2. Identify, research and understand your market
3. Identify and communicate to others, [sic] your personal skill and contextual knowledge of your dance style(s)
4. Communication how you carry out creative and composition skills appropriate to your target market
5. Communicate your competence and readiness to lead dance with specific groups of people and/or places
6. Use different media and methods to communicate with your target market
7. Design programmes of dance work that are appropriate to specific groups and individuals
8. Manage expectations with participating individuals, groups, funders and partners
9. Build relationships and trust with and within community groups to inspire take up to your session(s)
10. Build trust with host organisations and funders
11. Encourage involvement and collaboration with supporting teams
12. Deliver safe and effective dance leading
13. Engage and manage groups through your dance leadership in a creative context
14. Demonstrate technical skill and knowledge in leading your dance style(s)
15. Structure dance for engagement of participants and groups
16. Collaborate with other art forms
17. Work with volunteers, support workers and managers
18. Evaluate the impact of your dance leading through engagement with your groups and stakeholders
19. Communicate the results of evaluation the impact of your dance leading
20. Develop awareness in your participants and group
21. Recognise your professional development needs
22. Research, identify and resource your continuing professional development
23. Reflect on and resource your professional delivery


There is also a set of National Occupational Standards for Community Arts, which were originally developed alongside the Creative Apprenticeship Community Arts pathway. The majority of the skill areas referred to within the Community Arts NOS suppose that the role is largely administrative, and therefore does not engage with areas of artistic practice relevant to artists working in participatory settings, in the way in which the NOS in Dance Leadership does.


This document gives knowledge and advice of running arts workshops in schools. It develops the skills of both artists and teachers so that both roles can learn from one another.

Available as free download from http://www.nfer.ac.uk/publications/11113/


This manual gives a description of the required skills and resources needed for instrumental musical teaching. It is divided into instrument specific categories for the relevant teachers.


This is an audit of training infrastructures for artists wishing to or currently working as a participatory facilitator. It outlines formal courses alongside other informal, ad hoc training regimes. The research shows a pressing need for more formalised training structures within this field, alongside a more holistic approach across all art forms.
4.7 Policies for cultural education

This section comprises reviews and reports commissioned by the Government on culture and education.


This key report to the Secretaries of State for Education and Employment and for Culture, Media and Sport raised concerns about quality assurance and evaluation, which, in many ways, are still relevant (pp.147-148). It advised that DCMS should:

‘co-ordinate the development of a quality assurance system for partnerships between artists, arts organisations and the formal and informal education sectors.’

It also raised issues about the training of artists (pp.182-184), and recommended the monitoring and expansion of schemes such as those in place for linking music conservatoires and teacher training institutions. It made two overarching recommendations for the future training of artists:

- ‘Higher education institutions and cultural organisations should develop partnerships to provide accredited programmes of continuing professional development for artists and other specialists working in education.
- Training programmes for professional artists should include and placements to prepare students for work in education and community projects.’ (p. 187).


Music Education in England, was an independent review undertaken by Classic FM Managing Director Darren Henley for DfE and DCMS, into music education. The review makes 36 recommendations, including: a National Plan for Music Education, to enable more coherent/consistent delivery; that music education should remain a statutory part of the National Curriculum; that some central government funding should continue to be ring-fenced to support music education; and that collaborative geographically-specific delivery, through Music Education Hubs, should be encouraged. DfE issued a response which showed some enthusiasm for the National Plan, but caution over a number of other areas (particularly in respect of the forthcoming National Curriculum review). Arts Council England is currently handling the funding which has been attached to the Music Education Hubs.

Perhaps the most important recommendations in terms of the career development of musicians were those around a new qualification for ‘music educators’. Henley nods to the Diploma in Dance Teaching and Learning, and suggests it as a possible model for his Music Education Qualification. He anticipates the qualification as being:

‘primarily delivered through in-post training and continuous professional development....It would be as applicable to peripatetic music teachers as it would be to orchestral musicians who carry out Music Education as part of their working lives.’

In addition to this specific recommendation, Henley places emphasis on the role of conservatoires in supporting undergraduates to study the necessary areas to graduate from a conservatoire with the Qualified Music Educator award. He also recommends that conservatoires consider working with Teach
First to encourage musicians to teach in schools prior to moving on to their performance careers. Finally, Henley also cites an absence of leadership training for Music Educators, and recommends that investment should be made in this area. Elsewhere in the review, there is also a recommendation that a single register of music educators be established (replacing the currently pair of voluntary registers run by the Incorporated Society of Musicians and the Musicians’ Union), to support parents and carers to have confidence in the choices they make.


The government’s response to Darren Henley’s review was broadly warm to the recommendations of the review. In relation to the specific recommendations noted in the previous entry, DfE said:

- It saw the value of ‘professionalising the music education workforce’ via a qualification, and would talk to the TDA, HEIs and other ITT providers about this.
- It would work with Teach First to encourage musicians to consider engaging with the scheme.
- It would work through the establishment of a National Plan for Music Education to consider the issue of leadership.
- It would discuss with the MU and ISM how a database register might be set up.


The National Plan for Music Education followed the government response to Henley’s Music Education Review. In the section entitled ‘Workforce and Leadership’, the role of Music Education Hubs in ensuring the CPD of their own workforces, and in potentially supplying CPD activities which could be bought in by schools for teachers, is outlined. In relation to qualifications for the non-school-based workforce, the National Plan specifically refers to work undertaken by the Arts Council with CCS, key stakeholders, TDA and FE providers in developing qualifications for ‘creative practitioners. It goes on to say:

‘This work builds on an audit of qualifications for practitioners, and the resultant qualifications will be independently assessed and accredited and are likely to be modular. The Arts Council/CCS stakeholder group will look at whether those obtaining a certain mix of modules could be accredited as music educators. When complete in 2013, these developments will help to ensure the wider music workforce is better skilled and properly recognised for their role in and out of school.’

In respect of leadership, the National Plan only specifically considers the requirement for good leadership of the Music Education Hubs, and outlines how the application process to be a hub will require demonstration of a track record in leadership.


The review of the National Curriculum was announced in 2011; whilst there is still significant activity to be undertaken before definite decisions are made, it is the government’s intention to ‘slim-down’ the statutory curriculum in order to establish the core knowledge areas which children and young people should develop, and beyond this to enable schools to make more of their own choices about the remainder of the school curriculum activity. In the context of this intention, there has already been
some debate in key areas about the potential for arts and cultural subjects to find themselves no longer part of the statutory curriculum.

The expert panel report, *The Framework for the National Curriculum*, confirms the principle that “schools should be given greater freedom over the curriculum”, and draws a very specific difference between the National Curriculum – determined centrally, by government – and the school curriculum – the wider curriculum experience. This does not, however, mean that subjects are either required (as part of the National Curriculum) or otherwise completely optional, as the following quotation from the report shows:

“Evidence on the importance of curricular breadth persuades us that most existing curriculum elements should be retained in some statutory form. However, we recommend that some subjects and areas of learning should be reclassified so that there is still a duty on schools to teach them, but it would be up to schools to determine appropriate specific content. In other words, there would no longer be statutory Programmes of Study for such subjects.”

The report includes recommendations to change the current structure of Key Stages, creating a two-year KS3 and a three-year KS4, though the review notes some significant potential challenges in delivering this. It also outlines several options for recommendations, the second of which lists art and design and music as foundation subjects at Key Stages 1-3. The report suggests that Foundation subjects will:

"be specified for each relevant key stage through significant but refined and condensed Programmes of Study, with minimal or no Attainment Target"

There is also a recommendation that “the arts and music” should be made compulsory at Key Stage 4, as part of what will be called the “Basic Curriculum”, which allows schools to determine content.


Following on from the Darren Henley’s review of music education, DfE and DCMS requested a review of cultural education. The review, published in February 2012, makes some broad statements:

- That every child should have access to a rounded cultural education, and that this be enshrined to some extent in the national curriculum
- That a National Plan, and greater co-ordination and standardisation in certain areas, is required
- That there should be more co-ordinated work, from DCMS and DfE at government level, through the arms-length bodies and to a local level, connecting schools and cultural resources.

The review contains a section specifically on the workforce for cultural education, and includes the following recommendations:

- Recommendation 15 – connecting teachers to the cultural industries, to support their own practice and ensure that they know what is available
- Recommendation 16 – a package of learning resources to support teachers
- Recommendation 17 – new qualifications for ‘cultural practitioners’, supporting them to ‘professionalise and give greater recognition to this part of the workforce’.
- **Recommendation 18** – protecting the funding for conservatoires and other specialist HE institutions for training in cultural/arts practice

In respect of recommendation 17, Henley notes that Creative and Cultural Skills have already been charged with developing an appropriate suite of qualifications for practitioners in this area. In addition, there is a recommendation for ‘cultural education ambassadors’ to be developed from well-known names in this area, to raise the profile of this kind of activity. Finally, there are a range of recommendations relating to quality, including the broadening of Artsmark and Arts Award usage, and the role of Ofsted in ensuring delivery of quality cultural education by schools.


The government’s response to Darren Henley’s review was (as with the music education review) broadly warm to the recommendations of the review. In relation to the specific recommendations noted in the previous entry, DfE said:

- It committed to the development of a National Plan, and agreed that improved co-ordination and partnerships should be supported.
- It agreed with the emphasis on Artsmark and Arts Award for future wider use.
- That the remit of Bridge organisations would be widened to include heritage and film.
- That it agreed broadly with the workforce recommendations made, and noted (as Henley does) the work the Arts Council and CCS were already undertaking on qualifications (effectively the government response does not commit to anything beyond this).

The government was less keen to commit or offer detail about its views on the role of Ofsted or place of cultural education within the curriculum review.


This manifesto gives a broad critical perspective of the current state of music education and musical training.


The report gives a clear aim to provide music opportunities for all children, but it identifies a lack of clear co-ordination and unified framework to implement this. It produces a proposed framework, which acknowledges collaborative music education hubs as a way forward in creating more joined up thinking.
4.8 Career beginnings and motivations

4.8.1 How do people become artists working in participatory settings?

The annotated texts below explore the beginning of artist development, mostly through education, and how students or emerging artists are introduced to the artistic workforce. They also explore potential career paths open to practicing artists, or encouraged by the sector. Some texts also explore the challenges artists face when trying to carve a career path, or even question whether such paths exist.


This paper looks at several learning models and policies to come out of the initial five Pathfinders of the ArtWorks initiative. These models were developed after the key stages of research delved into what artists wanted from their career development pathways. Models were then developed, tested and evaluated and this paper seeks to share that knowledge to both further the field of research and provide peer-to-peer learning approaches for the sector.


This report explores the skills needed for working in participatory settings and incorporates in-depth consultation with 217 artists in order to ascertain the career paths of those working in participatory settings and their training needs and aspirations.

Creative and Cultural Skills (2013) Pathways to Design: Young People's Entry to the Design Sector, Essex: Creative and Cultural Skills

This study looks at current entry routes into the design sector for young people aged 16-25. The project reports on employer perceptions of current entry routes into the sector, their perceptions of the current education system and also researches skills issues in these entry points, with a view to expanding knowledge and understanding leading to development in this area.


This independent review was commissioned by the Department for Education and the Department for Culture Media and Sport and was conducted by Darren Henley, Managing Director of Classic FM. It considers how cultural education should be provided for in schools.

Dean, F. (2014) ArtWorks Scotland Research Report: Student Placements in Prison Learning Centres -A Partnership with New College Lanarkshire and the Department of Sculpture and Environmental Art, the Glasgow School of Art, Edinburgh: Creative Scotland

This paper evaluates the ArtWorks placement project and accompanying research. It focuses on the Further/Higher Education (FE/HE) partnership project between New College Lanarkshire, Offender Learning Services and Skills, and the Department of Sculpture and Environmental Art (SEA), The Glasgow
School of Art (GSA). The project involved the placement of 15 Undergraduate Fine Art, Higher Education students in 7 Scottish Prison Learning Centres. Students worked closely with 15 members of Learning Centre staff involving some 50 short and long term prisoners as participants in the project. This project contributes to wider debates on the importance of including participatory art (and experiences, such as placements) in an educational setting as an entry point to the sector and the career paths it contains.

Dean, F. (2014) Appendix 1: Student Placement Projects, Edinburgh: Creative Scotland

This appendix complements the previous report and evaluates the experiences of learners in prisons, staff and art school students in relation to process, motivations for being involved and impact felt from the placements. It also identifies potential from a partnership based approach.


This handbook draws together several chapters and concepts covering policy in American Art Education in a bid to support and professionalise the sector. It uses the scope of work collected as an assertion that the “field of art education has a body of scholarship” behind it.


This review presents headline findings of research into arts subjects at Key Stage 4. The subjects under investigation are GCSEs in Art & Design, Dance, Drama and Music. Included in this paper are proposed programmes of study with an aim to inform strategic discussions on the future development and the delivery of the KS4 arts curriculum.


This report features artists’ testimonies, case studies and guidance on career options and pathways after arts education. It draws on, and signposts to, blogposts, articles and other resources on the a-n website, and is divided into four main sections: The Internet and You, Exploring the Options, Nuts and Bolts and Doing it Yourself. It discusses issues of administration, promotion and professionalization and also considers how the conditions for artists’ work different between working in schools, with the public, in socially engaged practice and in the studio.


This report describes four case studies which provide an overview of some of the examples of courses available within Higher Education Institutions in London which offer training for artists working in participatory settings. They were gathered by a series of interviews with the institutions – Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance, Birkbeck, Royal Central School of Speech and Drama, University of London, and the University of East London.
4.8.2 How do you train and improve as an artist working in participatory settings?

These texts explore the professional development of artists and also provide guidance and frameworks for improving the area of professional development for artists, explored primarily through outputs from the ArtWorks programme.


This paper identifies key features of effective learning provision; prompts questions about the role of funders, employers and learning providers; and encourages a collaborative approach. Six case study examples show approaches in action with aims, structure, process, content and critical learning.


This article discusses the professional development needs of teacher-practitioners working across cultural and creative sectors and within Arts higher education. The paper argues that academia has responsibilities to engage with practitioners by supporting them in pursuing practice outside of HE, and in maintaining their identity as practitioners, acknowledging this as central to the value of their role.


This report is prepared by TBR’s Creative & Cultural Team working with Pomegranate. It examines issues related to skills, training and education for the Heritage Craft sector. It provides an overview of two focus groups held in 2013, which includes examples of initiatives and schemes relevant to the sector. This follows the publication of Mapping Heritage Craft.


This report analyses patterns and findings between the subsidised arts and cultural labour workforce and the commercial creative industries. It reports on economic findings and professional development of the sector between these two factions, through surveying 1,129 current or previous theatre workers.


This report offers a series of recommendations presented to the Creative Industries Council to instigate industry led proposals for addressing skills issues in order to boost the growth and competitiveness of the Creative Industries.

This report is a follow up to 2012 research conducted with ArtWorks Scotland and supported by Peer to Peer Networks. This second phase of research builds on previous understanding of the PPNs and gains further information about their journeys. This research identifies what has been the added value of being part of a Peer to Peer network, and what it enabled to happen that may not have been possible outside of the network.


This interim report brings together all the learning and findings from the Musical Inclusion programme to date. Musical Inclusion is Youth Music’s flagship programme and has received a £7 million initiative to ensure that children and young people in ‘challenging circumstances’ able to access music-making opportunities, not only now but in the future. As a piece on professional development it concentrates on relationships between managers of creative practitioners and developing their strategic skills. It also attempts to open discussions on quality within the context of wider inclusivity and whether the adoption of one lessens the other.


This paper focuses on a body of ArtWorks commissioned research into the needs of employers and commissioners, and reflects on their aims, expectations and requirements from the artistic workforce. It forms a suite of papers, encompassing 8 other titles, of which this one focuses on ArtWorks research and activity taking place across the programme that explores the complex ecology of arts practice in participatory settings in the UK.


This thesis explores the Continuing Professional Development (CPD) of mid-career artists in England and the South West of England in particular during 2000 to 2010. It identifies what their needs are and asks what CPD means to them; how they navigate their careers through their practice; how they articulate their needs; and how they negotiate to fulfil those needs. It examines to what extent the providers’ thinking about, and provision of, CPD in the region is aligned with the needs of the artists themselves. The individual narratives of artists are represented at the centre of this research. The research was developed in collaboration with University of Plymouth and the CPD agency, ArtsMatrix Ltd.


This paper identifies characteristics of effective artists’ CPD, analysing the ‘what /how’ of learning from different pathfinder opportunities. It concludes that many artists ‘learn on the job’ and appropriate training and qualifications are lacking.
This paper evaluates the Trinity Laban project, *Addressing the Dynamic*, which was formed by their Learning and Participation Teams. The project was one of seven awards of £3,500 granted by the PHF after discussions at the 2013 conference Changing Conversations. The research project focused on the role and skills of arts project managers. Personnel from Trinity Laban perceived that the role of project managers in building effective relationships with participatory artists is often overlooked but can be imperative to the success of arts participatory work.

4.9 Professionalisation

Under the larger heading of training artists to practice in participatory settings these texts build on Section 4.1 to offer guidance, policy frameworks and further discussion on engagement, artist development through training, standard-setting and accreditation for artists.


The CME is a qualification for all music educators working in England with children and young people, whether they work privately, in music hubs, orchestras, community music organisations or other settings. Developed by the music education sector, led by Arts Council England and Creative and Cultural Skills, the CME is designed to support inspiring, motivational learning and to be relevant to all music educators, regardless of the musical genre they work in or the stage of their career.


This report, prepared by Tamsin Cox and Susanne Burns, draws together the strands of work at a key stage in the evolution of ArtWorks. It contextualises the work within a wider policy context. It presents some themes that have emerged from the initiative and from the Changing the Conversation Conference, presents the seven pilot projects and outlines some considerations for the sector moving forward collectively to evolve the practice.


This guide offers arts and cultural organisations advice on how to develop high-quality and mutually beneficial internships, and sets out the legal obligations which organisations offering internship programmes must meet.


This article documents the research of the Nottingham Creative Partnership, over 23 schools, which lead to the development of an apprenticeship model of learning for the arts. It focuses on the development of a model to describe and guide the learning that takes place when artists (or other creative practitioners) work effectively with pupils in schools. The model was also useful in facilitating the professional development of the adults concerned: teachers, artists and others.
This paper provides a summary of the key learning from the four Artists Labs run by the Navigator pathfinder as part of ArtWorks between August 2012 and January 2013. These in-depth conversations with, and between, artists and employers/commissioners of artists working in participatory settings were carried out through face-to-face roundtable discussions and workshops, expert questioning by email and an online survey, using a range of qualitative and quantitative research methodologies.

This report aims to analyse the wealth of material collected during the Critical Conversations project. The scheme involved holding open discussions and roundtables with a number of artists who were asked to reflect on their practice within participatory settings. The results of these conversations lead to discussions on; relationships with participants, challenges artists face, structure of participatory practice, quality frameworks, the development of the artist as ‘expert’ and other themes around reflecting on practice.

This document report collates research carried out to improve understanding of the historic, current, and potential roles that community music can play in promoting community engagement, within the terms of the AHRC's 'Connected Communities' initiative. The research was conducted by a network whose activities consisted of four half-day meetings in 2013 which brought together a range of stakeholders (comprising academics, researchers, funders and commissioners, practitioners and managers). Discussion areas were derived around themes such as professional motivation, community engagement, evaluation of developmental practice and freedom and control.

This paper reviews the current situation for participatory artists as explored through ArtWorks activities, noting a need for better recognition and understanding of the practice. It also lists a range of particular skills, knowledge and attributes artists require, and opportunities for training providers to support artists’ employability.

This paper focuses on the perspective of different types of employers’ of artists as investigated through ArtWorks activities. It explores expectations, recruitment, quality factors, and the provision of training and CPD, including opportunities for development in this area.
4.10 Diversity, working conditions and other challenges that face the artistic workforce

These texts look at the makeup of the artistic workforce; exploring patterns in the labour force attracted to the sector, and also looking at themes such as diversity, equality, and marginalisation within the professional body of artists.


This study was commissioned by Arts Council England and delivered by Andy Parkinson and Jamie Buttrick from Consilium Research & Consultancy in partnership with Ann Wallis from Culture Partners. It reviews current and past evidence about equality and diversity within the arts and cultural sector in England using 146 studies to cover topics such as disability, race, gender and age. The report highlights key themes and presents a series of recommendations to guide the next phase of ACE’s research strategy.


This text reports on a wide-ranging study of labour in the cultural industries, and critically evaluates how various sociological traditions; including critical theory, governmentality and liberal-democratic approaches, have sought to theorise the creative cultural worker, in art, music, media and design-based occupations.


This text explores the emerging gulf between the purported need to be university-educated and how this mass influx of same-level educated individuals has flooded the labour market, causing a crisis of un- and under-employment and restricting creativity and artistic skill sets.


This speech, given by the Chair of Arts Council England Sir Peter Bazalgette, signals a ‘fundamental shift’ in ACE’s approach to diversity. The speech places responsibility for better diversity with every funded organisation, and that the starting point must be the art itself. The speech marks the adoption of the Arts Council’s Creative Case for Diversity; an approach that sees the creative potential of diversity and equality as an opportunity to enrich the arts for artists, audiences and the wider society. The Creative Case for Diversity goes mainstream in March 2015, rolling out until 2018.

Creative and Cultural Skills (2013) What do we know about the role of arts in the delivery of social care? Essex: Creative and Cultural Skills

This report, jointly commissioned Skills for Care, Skills for Care and Development and Creative & Cultural Skills informs thinking around the role of arts in the delivery of social care and the implications for workforce development.
This paper argues that while the employed worker in the creative industries has been positioned as a role model of contemporary capitalism, this provides insufficient perspective on labour and the creative economy. Informed by a larger research project, this article highlights key themes emerging from workers in nonstandard employment in the arts, media, and cultural industries.


This article examines a curriculum experiment at the University of Oregon within their art education course Women and Their Art. The goal in the experiment was to examine ways in which classroom dynamics and educational outcomes were affected by the introduction of a quilt making project. This participatory experiment was born of a lack of female art students engaging with female art heritage.


This text explores notions of quality in arts practice in participatory settings. Set within a context of cultural policy, arts funding cutbacks and a wider creative ‘industry’ it discusses innovative, but self-directed, forms of artistic production. It questions whether these practices of individualisation; such as pop-up performance, crowd-funding and necessary collaboration, empower practitioners or hinders creativity through necessity. Other themes explored within this include analysing the workforce this entrepreneurial approach creates, and the resilience of these individuals and the sector as a whole.


This text explores the problematic idea of regeneration through the participatory culture of the London Olympic and Paralympic Games, under the brand ‘London 2012’. It discusses material and rhetoric from the post-2005 bid victory that aimed to encourage the growth and regeneration of ‘East London’, and how this differed in post-2012 reality from the intended outcomes. It argues that East London, East Londoners and East London’s comparative deprivations were predominantly occluded from view, displaced by focuses on West and central London and a corporate brand ‘London 2012’. It is included here as a critique of how participatory culture (using the example of the 2012 Olympic Games) is valued, and how diversity of the creative labour force, (in this case through socio-economic and class differences,) is not actively encouraged.


This article is offered as a companion piece to the preceding work, as it discusses the wider conflicts between the cultural politics of London 2012. It briefly introduces the promoted positives of the Olympic Games within a cultural context; regeneration, diversity, environmental sustainability, notions of legacy and, vitally, cultural participation; with the juxtaposing negative outcomes of elitism, exclusion, commercial capitalisation and a lack of investment, either financially or socially. It questions how resources ploughed into the Cultural Olympiad programme actually deprived the arts sector of much-needed funding at a critical time of cutbacks and Government restriction; and how these conflicting yet complementary interests manifested throughout the 2012 campaign.

This report, commissioned by More Music and produced with funding from the Paul Hamlyn Foundation, as part of the ArtWorks special initiative, seeks to document the current state of play for artists from different cultural backgrounds working in arts practice in participatory settings across all the artforms in the UK North West. This report documents the journey of participatory artists tracking the conditions, attitude and skill set needed to reach the point of making a sustainable living. It also considers any differences faced by artists from black, Asian and ethnic minorities compared with their white counterparts. It also explores the relationship between BAME artists, arts organisations and funding; misconceptions, historical barriers and symbiosis of mutual support.


This report discusses the work and findings of Steiner and Schneider’s empirical investigation into artists’ job satisfaction. The analysis is based on panel data from the German Socio-Economic Panel Survey. It aims to investigate the paradox that although the artistic labour market is marred with challenges including low wages, above-average unemployment, and constrained underemployment, there is a high rate of job satisfaction, which continues to attract students and emerging artists to the workforce. Explanations include self-directed working hours, conditions and pay, flexible working conditions and superior ‘procedural’ characteristics of artistic work, such as increased variety and on-the-job learning.


This report examines institutional drivers and barriers to participatory art work, as well as individual perceptions and motivations. It offers recommendations to raise awareness and valuing of the practice; support inclusion in teaching programmes; and recognise employability benefits.


This paper reports on the preliminary findings of a research project into the values placed upon cultural practice by practitioners themselves in four participatory arts organisations in the East Midlands, UK. This paper argues that the values of cultural practitioners provide the basis for a more egalitarian and progressive model of cultural value than currently available to arts organisations in the UK.


This paper examines the legacy of New Labour’s cultural policies, including its development of the creative industries, through an account of the cultural workforce it has created. It discusses the belief that the kind of work creative industries provide is inherently progressive; combining demand for high skills with notions of self-expression and determination. It then counters this belief with evidence that the cultural labour market remains polarised by gender, ethnicity and social class. Despite high levels of
graduates, wages are low and class-based exclusion, often reflected in ethnicity, is a defining feature of the sector. The text provides both a historical account of New Labour ideas about work and how they shaped public policy, and a contemporary account of policy initiatives around workforce entry.

Oakley, K. (2009) 'The disappearing arts: creativity and innovation after the creative industries', *International Journal of Cultural Policy, 15, 4, pp. 403-413*

Since the birth of the ‘creative industries’, there has been a series of attempts to link the cultural sectors with innovation policy and to downplay the connection between them and traditional arts or cultural policy. The theory appears to be that innovation is where the big money is, and that the cultural sectors can only benefit by being rescued from the ‘ghetto’ of arts funding. This paper seeks to query this notion and to draw attention to some of the problems that have resulted and may result from it.

4.10 How do we measure and value the work of participatory artists?

These materials offer frameworks, policy and guidelines that can be adopted or applied to artist development, art engagement and participatory arts. The section also includes surveys, reports and studies that measure, or have produced quantitative data, for further research, analysis and discussion.


This report offers guidance for arts and cultural organisations undertaking or commissioning research into the economic benefits of their work. The report discusses the advantages and limitations of four methods of measuring economic impact, and is illustrated with a number of case studies.

*Bailey, J. (2009) Artistic vibrancy - Self-reflection tool, Australia Council for the Arts*

This toolkit was developed as an addition to the Australia Council for the Arts previous work on both defining and measuring artistic vibrancy. Building on that discussion with performing art companies and available research, this toolkit provides “ways to monitor, reflect upon and evaluate artistic vibrancy.”

*Blanche, R (2014) Developing a Foundation for Quality Guidance for arts organisations and artists in Scotland working in participatory settings, Edinburgh: Creative Scotland*

This report was commissioned by Creative Scotland and produced by Blanche Policy Solutions to provide a foundation for a quality framework for the arts practice in participatory settings in Scotland. It condenses material from the fields of arts, culture and education to develop into a guidance toolkit on Quality for the arts in Scotland.

*Blanche, R (2014) Insights for employers, commissioners and funders in facilitating quality impacts through Participatory Arts, Edinburgh: ArtWorks*

This is a development piece for the preceding work (Blanche, 2014) which highlights the three main insights to come from analysis undertaken for Creative Scotland. This analysis aimed to investigate concepts of quality in arts practice in participatory settings and pull together evolving perspectives that signify a paradigm shift in thinking on the issue. The analysis highlights a significant new way of
approaching the tricky question of how we can get optimum quality artist interventions in participatory settings.


This document presents the findings of the Manchester Metrics Pilot, which aimed to develop a metrics framework for the arts sector, based on the Western Australia method involving the triangulation of assessments of self, peer and public. The pilot was successful in developing a core set of framework dimensions but, this report also highlights the issues and challenges encountered through this assessment method. The pilot project itself was born out of the problems the arts and cultural sector face when trying to present the overall quality of its work in a way that both has credibility with funders and other stakeholders, and has the support of the arts sector.


This review, commissioned by Arts Council England, examines two related branches of literature based around ways in which cultural activities add value to the lives of individuals, and to society as a whole. These branches explore how individuals benefit from attending and participating in cultural programmes and activities; and the creative capacities of arts and cultural organisations to bring forth impacting programmes.

**Creative Skill Set (2013) Classifying and Measuring the Creative Industries, Essex: Creative Skill Set**

This document proposes a new, shared classification of the Creative Industries by looking at current DCMS classification, discussing issues with this standard and developing an updated model, with an aim to reinforcing the vital importance in understanding the size, shape and skills requirements of the creative workforce.


This paper reports the background research behind the 2012 infographic: *Quality Perspectives, Artists and Partners*. This research provided a clearer understanding of the Peer-to-Peer Network membership and the Network’s practice as artists in participatory settings. It particularly focuses on artists’ journeys into participatory settings, the diversity of roles as artists working in such settings and the factors that they feel support quality in relation to their work. This research informed Dean’s later work on *Revisiting Learning from the Peer-to-Peer networks* (2014).


This paper explores codes of conduct relevant to arts practice in participatory settings, and asks if a generic code covering all artforms, types and purposes of participatory could be constructed.
This report evaluates the procedures and outcomes of the Paul Hamlyn Foundation Development Awards, which offered funding of £3,500 each to seven projects to take forward issues, opportunities or ideas which had emerged at the ArtWorks conference in April 2014.

This survey evaluates the main findings from the first phase of research, which constituted an online survey with a range of UK-based artists undertaking at least some work in community, participatory and socially-engaged settings.

This report looks at the results from the survey, how different characteristics relate to responses, and what issues remain unclear or might be suitable for further investigation.

This report, compiled by HM Inspectorate for Education, outlines an approach to self-evaluation for use by practitioners working directly with young people, adults and community groups in Scotland. It builds on ongoing cross-sector work on evaluating services and provides a set of quality indicators and performance measures to aid practice and development.

This report analyses the current approach to the use of data in the cultural sector and argues that this is inadequate. It discusses the need for arts and cultural bodies to develop new policies towards data, with a particular emphasis towards ‘big data’.

Using policy papers and cultural statistics from Canada and Europe this paper confirms a widespread belief in creative economy policies as a solution for revitalising economies, while noting a general failure to acknowledge the role and the needs of creative workers. Existing policy instruments are mostly uncoordinated but can be divided into four categories entitled ‘education and training’, ‘awards and contests’, ‘business support’ and ‘social security policies’, with the greatest emphasis on the first three. Escaping the precarity trap – precarity meaning existence without security – typical of much cultural work requires a rehabilitated notion of flexible strategies to support cultural workers. The authors argue for a more holistic policy framework based on the intersection of social, labour and cultural policy.

This paper highlights many of the challenges facing the field of arts and health, most notably preoccupations with a model of evidence base of impact, resistance to definitions and the lack of research in to non-evidence based outcomes. It argues that these discrepancies cause this important area of study to be overlooked and dismissed by the scholastic sector. Increased attention should be paid to the description, analysis and theorising of the practice itself so the findings of impact studies can be understood and accepted within these scholarly circles. It concludes that an interdisciplinary theoretical framework for the practice could make a valuable contribution to the academic status of the field.


This paper draws on new research exploring community-based, Participatory Arts practice in Northern England and Mexico City to discuss contextual influences on artists’ practice, and whether a common practice model can be identified. The international comparison is used to interrogate whether such a practice model is transnational, displaying shared characteristics that transcend contextual differences.


This paper looks at three key studies, both from within the ArtWorks programme and outside of it, to consider the interrelated areas of Occupational Standards, Codes of Practice and Qualifications relating to artistic practice. This paper is part of a complementary suite of working papers that clarify the purpose and interrelationship of these three areas, and explore how they are capable of impacting on artists’ practice and employment prospects.


This paper collates current work being undertaken by ArtWorks Pathfinders in relation to quality, as a reaction to the findings on quality outlined in the *ArtWorks Interim Evaluation Report* (2013). The research aims to build a clear collective understanding of quality and quality frameworks, collate and distil relevant material from the ArtWorks programme and beyond, and offer considerations and recommendations about how the programme can make meaningful use of such material as it moves forward.

4.11 Policy debates on value recognition and reward for artists working in this area

These texts further explore artist value, focusing on discussions concerning artist recognition and reward. Some look at policy based initiatives to improve development in these areas.
This report presents data and findings from a range of surveys, most notably a-n’s own Big Artists’ Survey 2011, which look into the value attributed to visual arts and artists and the issues around financing work and retaining a livelihood through this career path. Paying Artists comes under ACE’s greater 10-year policy – Great Art and Culture for Everyone but argues its own case for recognising artists’ worth and, perhaps more importantly, how a lack of financial investment results in a deficit of artists and a greater reduction to the arts sector as a whole due to lack of opportunity to practice.


Artists’ Union England formally launched 1st May 2014. AUE aims to represent visual and applied artists at strategic decision making events in order to negotiate fair pay and better working conditions. The AUE was born from an evident lack of accountable, democratic, independent representation for artists.


Mapping Heritage Craft is a major study of the Heritage Craft Sector in England. The research, sponsored by the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (BIS), is a comprehensive study to define, categorise and examine the size and shape of the Heritage Craft sector.


This paper provides an investigation into the qualifications which support the creative and cultural industries, and recommendations for future development.


This paper was presented at the 2012 Elsin Conference, Cardiff, and discusses the research and findings of a form of evaluative methods undertaken on students of creative practice-based disciplines at the University of Newcastle. These include surveys, questionnaires and in-depth interviews that seek to find out how areas such as space, environment, peer group and individual differences affect artistic learning and development.


This paper draws together 18 reports of consultations with artists that each of the ArtWorks Pathfinders undertook at the inception of their work with the ArtWorks programme. These findings are explored thematically to display the key outcomes of these consultations as both form of practice reflection, and an informal source of training and professional development.

This article builds on Throsby’s original work (Throsby and Withers 1983) which sought to measure the community’s willingness to pay for the perceived public-good benefits of the arts. The methodology for researching this question applied an economic model – the contingent valuation method – to the arts sector, believed to be the first time this had been done. While this original work was pioneering in discussing the value of arts through an economic discourse Throsby here argues that this method provides an incomplete picture of the valuation of the arts and that alternative measuring frameworks need to be established to complement and enhance economic methods, such as the CVM.

4.12 Literature reviews

The following annotated texts are all published reviews of relevant literature, including two from the Artworks partners (Navigator, 2012 and Consilium, 2012).


An annotated bibliography of documents identified through the mapping of resources “that are inspirational for artists leading in participatory settings”. Although many of these were not artform specific, the bibliography identifies and categorises some resources by artform and includes handbooks, journal and magazine articles and online resources as well as general background reading.


AHRC Connected Communities literature review by Professor George McKay, University of Salford and Ben Higham; AHRC - From Navigator’s annotated bibliography: “A key text for community musicians in understanding their place and progress, produced as the lead output of an AHRC Connected Communities programme research review”. Available to download at [http://salford.academia.edu/georgemckay/Papers/1117860/Community_Music_History_and_Current_Practice_its_Constructions_of_Community_Digital_Turns_and_Future_Soundings](http://salford.academia.edu/georgemckay/Papers/1117860/Community_Music_History_and_Current_Practice_its_Constructions_of_Community_Digital_Turns_and_Future_Soundings)

**Annotated Bibliography of Community Music Research Review**
[http://salford.academia.edu/georgemckay/Papers/1115916/Annotated_Bibliography_of_Community_Music_Research_Review_AHRC_Connected_Communities_Programme](http://salford.academia.edu/georgemckay/Papers/1115916/Annotated_Bibliography_of_Community_Music_Research_Review_AHRC_Connected_Communities_Programme)

**POLCA (2009) ‘Literature review on Community Arts’, conducted by the University of Molise, January 2009**

Power of Local Community Arts (POLCA) is an EU funded project examining “different good practices of Community Art in Europe” with respect to facilitating intercultural dialogue, coordinated by Spectrum Gelderland Centrum Maatschappelijke Ontwikkeling (Spectrum Gelderland Centre for Societal Development), The Netherlands and with Belgian, Italian and Austrian partners. Community Arts is defined as “a method of learning by art with its goal to make experience and value the local culture in comparison with the other cultures (to create an intercultural dialogue). The art is a bounding means in learning-processes to develop the intercultural dialogue which increases social cohesion and
participation of inhabitants”. The project ran a series of six transnational meetings, as well as local arts projects and research. The literature review was developed in order to assist this work. It includes the headings:

- Community art: general elements
- The role of Community Art in society
- How does the Arts contribute to a democratic process of social inclusion?
- The Power of Local Community Art”

It discusses various issues in reference to the northern European context and agendas concerning interculturalism, and also includes a short bibliography of US, European and some UK writing about and relevant to community arts as well as set of resource links. The outputs of the project in terms of new European methods and tools for community arts practices were disseminated through meetings and newsletters and via the website.


This literature review forms part of a wider survey of activities and learning about artists working in participatory settings, with a particular focus on the Scottish context and on looking for/working towards ‘a systematic and strategic approach to supporting skills development support for artists (across artform) working in participatory settings’. The review particularly considers what has been learnt through evaluations and audits undertaken by the Scottish Arts Council, and from recent analyses undertaken by Creative and Cultural Skills in respect of Scotland. It acknowledges a wealth of literature which provides guidance for artists working in particular areas of practice and settings, and also looks at two competency frameworks, put forward by Creativity, Culture and Education (CCE) in 2009 and by the Consortium for Participatory Arts Learning (C-PAL) in 2011. The review concludes by indicating that much of the learning from activity taking place in participatory settings has not extended to questions about the support required by artists to develop appropriate skills and experience. It identifies a range of positive things – the a focus on skills development in Scottish Government’s Education and Culture Action Plan and the two competency frameworks – which could be further built upon. The review concludes by indicating that further specific research is required:

‘Specifically further research is required in order to identify firstly what skills are required to work within the settings, secondly what skills development support is needed for the sector and thirdly artist’ views on the format and structure of the support dependent on career stage.’


This review covers debates relating to ‘culture’ and ‘creativity’ in education in English, since 1944.


This review examines the development of arts education and its relationship to the concept of creativity. Its aim is to provide a review of some of the key literature which explores arts education, its traditions
and distinct subject issues, and how these either differ or overlap with more general writings on creativity.
Reference and reading lists
5 Reference and reading lists

This section provides a full reference list of those texts included in this literature review, and also supplies some further bibliographies taken from reading lists used in teaching and training in applied and participatory practices in higher education.

5.1 Reference list


Blanche, R (2014) Insights for employers, commissioners and funders in facilitating quality impacts through Participatory Arts, Edinburgh: ArtWorks


Creative & Cultural Skills (2010a) ‘Sector Skills Agreement for the creative and cultural industries: An analysis of the skills needs of the creative and cultural industries in England’ (December, 2010)

Creative & Cultural Skills (2010b) ‘Sector Skills Agreement for the creative and cultural industries: An analysis of the skills needs of the creative and cultural industries in Wales’ (December, 2010)

Creative & Cultural Skills (2010c) ‘Sector Skills Agreement for the creative and cultural industries: An analysis of the skills needs of the creative and cultural industries in Northern Ireland’ (December, 2010)

Creative & Cultural Skills (2011) ‘Sector Skills Agreement for the creative and cultural industries: An analysis of the skills needs of the creative and cultural industries in Scotland’ (April, 2011)


Creative and Cultural Skills (2013) Pathways to Design: Young People’s Entry to the Design Sector, Essex: Creative and Cultural Skills

Creative and Cultural Skills (2013) What do we know about the role of arts in the delivery of social care? Essex: Creative and Cultural Skills


Dean, F. (2014) Appendix 1: Student Placement Projects, Edinburgh: Creative Scotland

Dean, F. (2014) ArtWorks Scotland Research Report: Student Placements in Prison Learning Centres - A Partnership with New College Lanarkshire and the Department of Sculpture and Environmental Art, the Glasgow School of Art, Edinburgh: Creative Scotland


Jones, R. (2004) *Get Sorted - how to get organised, sort the budget and go for funding for your youth arts project!* Artworks


Langford, S. & Mayor, S. (n.d.) *Sharing the Experience: How to Set up and Run Arts Projects Linking Younger and Older People.* Magic Me


POLCA (2009) ‘Literature review on Community Arts’, conducted by the University of Molise, January 2009


Staffordshire University (2012) MA Community and Participatory Arts Programme Specification. Faculty of Arts, Media and Design.


5.2 Further reading

The following bibliographies draws together key texts used in teaching and training in applied and participatory practices in higher education, by subject area, art form and/or practice focus.

5.2.1 Applied Theatre, Performance and Drama


Blatner, A. (2007) Interactive and Improvisational Drama: varieties of Applied Theatre and Performance iUniverse.com


Brook, P. (1987) The Shifting Point, Theatre Communications Group


Carey, J. (2005) What Good are the Arts? Faber & Faber


Cleveland, W. (1992) Art in other places: Artists at work in America’s community and social institutions Praeger


Fountain, T. (2007) So You Want To Be A Playwright?: Nick Hern Books
Fraden, R. (2001) Imagining Medea: Rhodessa Jones and Theater for Incarcerated Women University of North Carolina


Matarasso, F. (1997) Use or Ornament? The Social Impact of Participation in the Arts Comedia


McKenzie, J. (2001) Perform or Else: From Discipline to Performance Routledge


Theatre de Complicite, Complicite Rehearsal Notes www.complicite.org


5.2.2 Arts and cultural management with communities

This is a general bibliography from a Level 4 Arts Management unit on theoretical aspects of community arts practice


Final report - Froggett_report.pdf


5.2.3 Arts and Health


Smith, T. (2003) An Evaluation of Sorts: Learning from Common Knowledge. An essay based on a research project to evaluate Common Knowledge – a three-year Tyne & Wear Health Action Zone initiative to improve health through more creative working between arts and health sectors., Centre for Arts and Humanities in Health and Medicine, University of Durham.


White, M. (2005) In a different kitchen: Community-based arts in health. Centre for Arts and Humanities in Health and Medicine, University of Durham, Retrieved from www.dur.ac.uk/cahhm.info

White, M. (2005) Well being or well meaning? Centre for Arts and Humanities in Health and Medicine, University of Durham, Retrieved from www.dur.ac.uk/cahhm.info


5.2.4 Arts in Education/Creative Learning


Department for Children, Schools and Families. It’s Child’s Play: Early Years and Foundation Stage: A new framework for learning, development and care for children from birth to age 5, Department for Children. Schools and Families (now Department for Education), 2008


http://www.coe.int/T/DG4/Linguistic/Prague_studies07_EN.asp#TopOfPage


Manchester Children’s and Young People’s Strategic Plan 2010-12, Children’s Services, Manchester City Council, 2009 18

Manchester 2010 Demographics Factsheet, Corporate Research and Intelligence, Manchester City Council, 2009.


National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education (NACCCE) (1999). All Our Futures. London: DfEE.


5.2.5 Dance (DDTAL)


5.2.6 Literary Arts


5.2.7 Music and Community Music


5.2.8 Theatre in the Criminal Justice System


Thompson, J. (1999) Drama Workshops for Anger Management and Offending Behaviour Jessica Kingsley


5.2.9 Theatre for Development


5.2.10 Theatre in Education


National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education 1999 All Our Futures: Creative, Culture and Education


5.2.11 Visual Art


http://www.uclan.ac.uk/schools/school_of_social_work/research/pru/files/wzw_nmi_report.pdf


Scottish Arts Council (2002) Making their mark: an audit of visual artists in Scotland